# A postfoundational ubuntu accepts the unwelcomed (by way of 'process' transversality)

Wayne G. Smith Department of Systematic Theology University of Pretoria South Africa

#### Introduction

This interdisciplinary conversation seeks to facilitate a rational, transversal conversation between the speculative cosmology of English mathematician and philosopher A.N. Whitehead commonly known as 'process'<sup>19</sup> thought and the operative principles and lines of force and congruent attractions and repulsions in the African concept of ubuntu.

19. We acknowledge here the strong *caveat* and challenge by Seibt (2005) against a total equation of the terminology and structure of Whitehead's philosophy of organism with the nomenclature of 'process'. While 'the term "process ontology" should not be equated with Whitehead's philosophy' (Seibt 2005:2) it is employed here and throughout as a shorthand reference, aware of the formal inadequacy of its usage. It is further acknowledged that the thesis of this chapter rests heavily on the implications of ontological and relational space both occupied and resisted (i.e. welcomed and unwelcomed) between societies and

How to cite: Smith, W.G., 2017, 'A postfoundational ubuntu accepts the unwelcomed (by way of 'process transversality'), in 'Ecodomy – Life in its fullness', Verbum et Ecclesia, suppl. 1, 38(3), a1556. https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v38i3.1556

Ubuntu has been arguably translated into English as 'a person is a person through other persons' (e.g. Forster 2010a, 2010b; Louw 2001:15). Ubuntu is commonly understood to proffer utopic 'virtues that reflect an orientation towards other people, like kindness and hospitality' (Kruidenier 2015:3 of 7). The usual, and historically preferred, 'hermeneutical process' (Müller 2015:3) of ubuntu has until now – we respectfully post – begun and ended on a foundation of the best of human (individual and societal) nature.

However, it is the thesis of this chapter that such a hermeneutics of utopian optimism stands to be respectfully challenged by dystopian realities, which are also part of the human condition. As Louw (2001:26) observes, the African aphorism 'incorporates both relation and distance.' The operative lens of this work is this: How much more 'distant' can we be from one another when we are at enmity? Also, how much more 'related' are we when we are restored to one another and within our societies? Ubuntu, understood in a postfoundationalist manner, can and does account for and includes not just the 'saints' among us but also the 'sinners' – not just relation but also distance, the welcomed and the unwelcomed.

# Philosophy of organism ('process')

The terms 'relation and distance', and the ontologies which they represent, are described in Whiteheadean terms as reflective of the existential 'various grades of proximity and remoteness.' Whitehead equates his category of positive prehensions with persistence and continual relations. He associates negative prehensions with elimination. It may be safely posited that personal and unending (i.e. enduring) positive human relations without distance is a world that does not exist – in any culture, African or otherwise. Whitehead's categorical scheme (1978:187) acknowledges and works with this reality: '[A]n absolute extreme of undifferentiated endurance [is a world] of which we have no direct evidence.'

Whiteheadean relations of proximities and occasions of personal distance of remoteness reflect the philosophy of organisms' account of the play of contrasts which defines all ontologies and their relationships: '[N]o realized eternal object shall eliminate potential contrasts' (Whitehead 1978:278).

(footnote 19 continues...)

their constituent members as well as the space both occupied and resisted between the concepts and realities and epistemologies depicted in both Whiteheadean 'process' thought and that outlined by postfoundational understanding of ubuntu. See the 'General Process Theory' (GPT) challenge to Whiteheadean 'entities that never move' (Whitehead 1978:73) and yet they relate as explicated by Seibt who charges that the Whiteheadean construct (and therefore, in this chapter's context, also to some understandings of ubuntu) are 'strangely incongruent since emergent one-place properties apparently lack proper logical subject' (Seibt 2009:481).

Whitehead (1978) describes the world and other people that we encounter as providing the 'presentational immediacy' (p. 174) of publicly-presented influences (data) which require our private interpretation, which is always subsequent and consequent to the encounter which is prehended. It is important in the philosophy of organism to acknowledge that the *real* world lies behind, beneath and beyond each encounter:

We open our eyes and our other sense-organs; we then survey the contemporary world decorated with sights, and sounds, and tastes; and then, by the sole aid of this information about the contemporary world, thus decorated, we draw what conclusions we can as to the *actual* world. (Whitehead 1978:174; emphasis added)

The actual world of meaning, for Whitehead, is found in the interpretation of life's encounters which facilitate their subjective integration from the objective realities. For Whitehead (1978) '[t]hese integrations often involve various types of "symbolic reference" (p. 173).

The creaturely demands on our symbolic references are a process by which the many influences of life are necessarily reduced for our single incorporation by our selective prehensions. Some influences and data we take in or accept or appropriate into our lives and sense of being (positive prehensions) and others are either rejected or held in abeyance for some future consideration (negative prehensions). Whitehead (1978:211) applies linguistic symbolism in his use of his all-important concept contained in the word 'concrescence' as it bears the ontological freight of explaining the whole process by which each 'subsequent and therefore new' event arising from the interface of previous events – an evolution (with no moral judgement) as 'the process in which the universe of many things acquires an individual unity.' That ontological unity is a composite one because 'it' will offer parts of itself for subsequent 'subordination' to its ontological successor. It is the bold thesis of our 'process' ubuntu conversation that the word and motion implicit in such a concrescence exactly describes the relational ontology of ubuntu: a person is a person through other persons.

Whitehead (1978) explains that the central principle of 'process' is that each entity is 'constituted by its becoming' (p. 23) and the central element of that becoming is extended by which 'the term "many" presupposes the term "one", and the term "one" presupposes the term "many" (Whitehead 1978:21). It is a relational ontology in which each occasion is an 'event' which arises from the concrescence of prior events. In this philosophy of organism, the becoming of events occurs out of prior events.

Every event in life, however familiar it may appear, is in this cosmology not exactly as its predecessor(s) – hence, each prehension is novel and is each concrescence. This creative advance is the essence of Whiteheadean relational ontology and it is the very 'nature of things that the many enter into a complex unity ... the many become one, and are increased by one ... [producing] a novel togetherness' (Whitehead 1978:21).

Each 'one' is 'a system of all things' (1978:36). This ontology serves to 'blur the distinction between what is universal and what is particular.' A few paraphrased reverberating renditions of ubuntu seem appropriate at this juncture: I am because you are, I am through you, I love because you love, I suffer because you suffer.

# Etymology of ubuntu provides a transversal node

Transversal touchpoints with this 'process' ontology can be discerned in an etymological description of the symbolic representation of the relational ontology of ubuntu:

Ubu evokes the idea of being in general. It is enfolded being before it manifests itself in the concrete form or mode of existence of a particular entity. In this sense ubu is always oriented towards ntu. At the ontological level there is no strict separation between ubu and ntu. Ubu and ntu are mutually founding in the sense that they are two aspects of being as an oneness and an indivisible whole-ness. Ubu as the generalized understanding of being may be said to be distinctly ontological; ntu as the nodal point at which being assumes concrete form or a mode of being in the process of continual unfoldment may be said to be distinctly epistemological. (Ramose 2001:para. 3)

Ubu cannot be separated from ntu: the former provides the universal and the lived individualities of the many 'ntu' reflect the many 'ones' in community. In this we can hear the concurrent Whiteheadean description (Whitehead 1978:29) of this relational ontology by which the many become one and the one becomes the many which are increased by one – and the 'many' provide the way in which the collective 'one' (or ones) to which they belong, enter into the world.

This chapter is anthropological as it does not deal with the theological or human understanding of their relations to the divine (e.g. 'vertical' in Forster 2010b:7–8 of 12) but rather with the 'horizontal relationships that shape who one is. True (ubuntu) identity ... is shaped through *shared* life *in* the community' (Forster 2010b:9 of 12; emphasis added). Such a relationship as defined by ubuntu is understood to be reflective of 'individual identity [that] is based upon a complex active interrelationship of beings that share a common meaning in community' (Forster 2010b:9 of 12). It is the thesis of this transversal examination of a selected commonality between ubuntu and 'process' constructs that complexity of human interaction cannot arbitrary and *a priori* limit what would, or would not, qualify as falling within the realm of 'complex'. Also, the question of seeking 'common meaning' invites a question as to what would constitute the fullest of human 'meaning'. The answer implied in the fundamental perspective of this study is that it is in responses to occasions of suffering that humanity discovers threats and challenges to 'meaning'. The 'localised' (i.e. horizontal) meaning provided by a community to its ubuntu constituents

(because 'it' is, then 'we are') contains not some but all of life's occasions – the welcomed and the unwelcomed.

Whitehead's cosmology coheres with the Ramosean explanation of ubuntu: For Whitehead, the atemporal, or trans-temporal, ontological ground is, firstly, the 'one' (cf. ubu-) comprised of 'the multiplicity of data' (Whitehead 1978:224) and, secondarily, the source of meaning is located in the activity of the creative prehensions of individual's entities (cf. -ntu) as they exist in the nexus of 'prehension' (Whitehead 1978:191).

# Transversality

However, 'universal' we might wish to maintain that both ubuntu's creaturely interrelated sensibilities and 'process' categories of relations may be, this conversation between them is not suggesting a universality forced between them to seek a larger meaning but rather the application of a 'figure of discourse – that of "transversality" ... [which] replaces universality' (Schrag 1994:75). This conversation strives to enact a transversality 'extending over, lying across, intersecting, and converging without a resultant coincidence' (Schrag 1994:65). Such a transversal interface – if it is to be coherent and rational – requires a point or points, of praxis between the interlocutors. This chapter treats occasions of creaturely suffering and influences and impulses that would threaten a community as located at a 'praxial critique [serving as] the place from which discernment and valuation issue' (Schrag 1994:73).

In this chapter, occasions of unwelcomed influences in life provide the conduit for a dialogue of transversality in that they lie across, extend over, intersect both the speculative structure of 'process' thought and speak to what defines an ubuntu community. Schrag (1994:65) refers to a 'play of figuration' which defines a transversal conversation. The two disciplines will reveal in their transversal considerations 'some family resemblances' (Schrag 1994:65).

This study is aware of the danger, and some ongoing suspicion, within the African academy of appropriation by thinkers of the Western and Northern Hemispheres of worldview historically viewed as alien itself and imposition of an Anglo-Saxon worldviews upon a study of ubuntu.

The extension sought in this work is that this dialogue can achieve two goals, namely, (1) free the philosophy of ubuntu from a foundationalist residence on some utopic ship, isolating outside of its schema all manifestations of human dystopic tendencies (as being un-ubuntu) and therefore unable to speak to human suffering and (2) can also release its 'process' interlocutor from allegations of an isolation in a speculative and philosophical bubble. Such a conversation can bring a sense of freedom to both. Ramose (2003:7) holds

out the promise of such transversal freedom, in his observation that 'it is clear that the liberation of philosophy is possible only through dialogue.'

In a concurring defence of a transversal conversation between an ubuntu schema and that of a 'process' relational ontology (i.e. cosmology), Whitehead, speaking in harmony with Ramose, observes that in the history of culture(s) the general assumptions must be fluid and cannot remain in isolation, immune from change just as 'the older hills, are worn and diminished in height, surpassed by younger rivals (Whitehead 1978:10).

Space does not permit an examination of all the probable inconsistencies and failures that reside in all human endeavours, not less that of ubuntu and 'process' thought. It is enough to say here that both philosophical worlds that each have created, and whose respective views of life they reflect, are not monocultures but are multivalent in themselves. Van Huyssteen (2000) observes that there is, in all systems of thought:

[T]he kind of cognitive fluidity that enables true interdisciplinary dialogues with one another as a form of transversal reasoning. Transversality in this sense justifies and urges and acknowledgement of multiple patterns of interpretation as one moves across the borders and boundaries of different disciplines. (p. 427)

It is the premise of this work that occasions of suffering, oppression, misery, injustice, evils and – with apologies to Shakespeare – the 'thousand natural shocks that flesh is heir to' (Shakespeare 2003–2005, *Hamlet*, Act III, Scene 1, l. 1755–1756) each provide in this study the precise point of philosophical and existential conciliation and a transversal conversation between ubuntu and 'process'. This will be addressed momentarily.

In citing his own 1999 work entitled *The Shaping of Rationality: Toward Interdisciplinarity in Theology and Science* Van Huyssteen (2005:1) applies transversal rationality as a 'heuristic device ... for identifying those interdisciplinary spaces where the relevance of scientific knowledge can be translated into the domain of Christian theology and vice versa.' Although Van Huyssteen was here self-referencing his dialogue between theology and science, we present here that an interdisciplinary conversation between the philosophies of Whitehead and ubuntu provides a prime candidate for Van Huyssteen's 'interdisciplinary space for thinking between more than one knowledge system or reasoning strategy' (Van Huyssteen 1998:5). It is the thesis of this chapter that the two knowledge systems and reasoning strategies of 'process' cosmology and the relational ontology of ubuntu exhibit, and can yield, productive meaning through 'transversal lines of force that issue from that which is other' (Schrag 1994:74)

This present conversation presents each occasion of human dystopia – even evil – as a proper candidate for his 'interdisciplinary space' between Whitehead's philosophy of organism and ubuntu as understood outside of its foundationally-understood utopian boundaries:

Would it be possible to identify between radically diverse disciplines something like a common issue a shared problem a kind of mutual concern or even a shared overlapping research trajectory that might benefit precisely from interdisciplinary dialogue? (Van Huyssteen 2005:1)

Utopic views of the concept and relationships inherent within and reflected by ubuntu must expand the boundaries of what it is to be the fullest 'ubu-' community of which each 'ntu' is a part. The community of the welcomed must share the same world as the unwelcomed if their interplay is to be acknowledged. The inclusion of the creaturely unwelcomed within a post-foundationally understood ubuntu respects its context and expands its application beyond its origins.

Such an expanded understanding and application of ubuntu 'acknowledges that human knowledge is contextually shaped, but recognizes that human rationality is not contextually bound.' (Loubser 2012:85). Occasions of misery and unwelcomed occasions can provide the conduit for this 'process-ubuntu' conversation, in a 'postfoundationalist approach' which reinforces and supports:

- 1. the role of context
- 2. the epistemically crucial role of interpreted experience
- the way that tradition shapes the epistemic and non-epistemic values that inform our reflection about God and what some of us believe to be God's presence in this world
- 4. the need to point creatively beyond the confines of the local community, group or culture toward a plausible form of cross-contextual and interdisciplinary conversation (Van Huyssteen in Loubser 2012:85).

We suggest that a postfoundational understanding of ubuntu assists the type of transversality that can be deployed in healing the divide between 'him' or 'her' from 'us'. Accepting that a relationship of true ubuntu 'overcomes, and corrects, many of the effects of radical dualism between self and other' (Forster 2010b:6 of 12), then it must surely be irrefutably counter to the indivisibility of the existentially and epistemologically conjoined ubu and ntu to place outside of its epistemological and existential boundaries even the personally and socially unwelcomed among us: brokenness and wholeness are bound together. To cleave the unity of ubuntu by exclusion of some diversity of '-ntu' is to limit ubuntu to the 'confines of the local community, group or culture' (Van Huyssteen in Loubser 2012:85).

The whole includes all of its parts: '[T]he African approach [is one through which] one cannot reduce identity simply to the experiences of the individual, or the perceptions of the group' (Forster 2006:6, n. 7) and in the 'mutual implication of extensive whole and extensive part. If you abolish the whole, you abolish its parts; and if you abolish any part, then that whole is abolished' (Whitehead 1978:268).

A postfoundational ubuntu takes seriously that any definition of parochialism is not the fullest possible reflection of the African ethical demands of ubuntu. On the contrary, a foundationalist identity, that is to say, a foundationally-limited category of knowledge, mistakenly presumes all individual qualities of identity 'mean the same thing to me as they do to you ... [h]owever, identity is no longer a matter that is so easily verifiable' (Forster 2010b:2 of 12).

This chapter's discussion of a postfoundational ubuntu considers as a question the verifiability of identity and 'personhood'. The 'African cosmology' (Kanu 2013:533) of ubuntu must be inclusive by its own definition, as noted in Forster (2006).

An admittedly oversimplified definition of the ethic of ubuntu can be found if its translation is limited to – however admirable – humane care (Forster 2006:15 of 29, n. 14). It is conceded, with Nkhata (2010:34), that ubuntu bears in itself a 'lack of amenability to an all-embracing definition.' That being said, '[t]he significance of *ubuntu* becomes much clearer when its social value is highlighted' (Nkhata 2010:35). The 'social value' of such 'humane care' comes under a special postfoundational examination when the unwelcomed are excluded from the definition of a person or human. This occurs whenever the opposite of a person having ubuntu is proffered:

'usibani bani ungumuntu' (meaning 'that person is a human' or, 'that person has "ubuntu") is proffered in phrases such as 'akamuntu walutho lowo' ('that one has no use or help'). (Forster 2010b:8 of 12)

A postfoundational (and processive) understanding of ubuntu frees itself from communal xenophobia, which is also part of the human condition:

Evolution has made Homo sapiens, like other social mammals, a xenophobic creature [who instinctively divides humanity into two parts, 'we' and 'they' leading us – especially when encountering some other 'them' – to claim that [w]e are all responsible for each other, but not responsible for them [i.e. the unwelcomed]. We don't want to see any of them in our territory, and we don't care an iota what happens in their territory. They are barely even human. (Harari 2014:195–196)

A pre-postfoundational understanding of ubuntu fails to account for those that those unwelcomed and dystopic occasions among the many '-ntu' that comprise the One 'ubu'. There is cultural transversal congruence in xenophobic impulses noted from broader research. An revealing citation of Harari's research is pertinent to this current search for an inclusive ubuntu:

In the language of the Dinka people of the Sudan, 'Dinka' simply means 'people'. People who are not Dinka are not people. The Dinka's bitter enemies are the Nuer. What does Nuer mean in Nuer language? It means 'original people'. Thousands of kilometres from the Sudan deserts, in the frozen ice-lands of Alaska and north-eastern Siberia, live the Yupiks. What does Yupik mean in Yupik language? It means 'real people' (Harari 2014:196).

The existential presence of the unwelcomed includes occasions of suffering, even evil(s), and the unwanted, the 'non-persons', the one of 'no use'. The inclusion of the personally and socially unwelcomed within an expanded ubuntu boundary, as voiced by De Beer (2015:4 of 12) is a 'demand of respect for persons *no matter what their circumstances might be.*' (emphasis added).

It is the unwelcomed that present to this process-ubuntu conversation its 'specific transversal issue' (Loubser 2012:97). This specific transversal issue 'provides moments and spaces of convergence within which productive interdisciplinary discourse can occur' (Reynhout (2011:2). We now address that discourse.

Entities, events, and persons are not static and – in addition to the process-ubuntu transversal touchpoint between the welcomed and the unwelcomed – these three prove a congruent relationality between ubuntu and 'process' that is found in each discipline's paradoxical ontology of the juxtaposition of each moment at the nexus of the stability of presence and the creative lure of the 'not yet'.

The essence of ubuntu, from Louw (2001:26) is its 'perception of the other [as] never fixed or rigidly closed but adjustable or open-ended. It allows the other to be, to become.' This relational conduit finds transversal concurrence in one of Whitehead's definitive categories of explanation. In this it is explained that every single living event has the potential to be part of a larger concrescence of events, data, impulses or occasions. It is this potential that is 'the one general metaphysical character attaching to all entities, actual and non-actual; and that every item in its universe is involved in each concrescence' (Whitehead 1978: 22).

This transversal conversation acknowledges that it is also true in the cosmology of ubuntu that the aphorism 'denotes both a state of being and one of becoming' (Louw 2001:26); so too in Whitehead (1978):

[*H*]ow an actual entity becomes constitutes what that actual entity is; so that the two descriptions of an actual entity are not independent. Its 'being' is constituted by its 'becoming'. This is the 'principle of process'. (p. 23)

# Evil and suffering as a mutual concern between ubuntu and 'process'

The portrayals of human evils and dystopic manifestations reflect congruent definitions of the unwelcomed parts of human interaction in each of Whitehead's 'processes' systematically and in ubuntu. Acknowledging the best-case impetus of ubuntu as an African gift to the world does not remove the reality that peaceful interactions are, regrettably, 'often not the first activities that spring to mind when one reflects on

Africa' (Louw 2010:2). The relational 'because' and 'through' of the ubuntu does not protect the collective nor its constituent members from harm. Neither does the relational ontology of ubuntu provide a protection from societal and/or personal dysfunction as a healthy body cell might retreat from an infectious presence, lest it be contaminated.

Ubuntu, as the 'relational ontological approach to individual identity' (Forster 2010b:7 of 12) must by definition include all that it is to be fully human – the 'blessed' and the 'sinful'. Forster (2010a) appears to support (unintendedly?) the inclusion of unwelcomed tendencies of human interaction within the rubric of ubuntu in as much as the human community includes persons:

[W]ho help one grow through affirmation, nurture and care, and others who help one grow through conflict, disappointment and struggle. (p. 250)

Definitions of ubuntu which seek to present a prophylactic to protect a relational intersubjectivity from unwelcomed factors of human behaviour do a disservice to the reality of the panoply of human interaction, including both live-giving and of destruction. For example, the glue of the societal norms of traditional relations (and in this example of intergenerational relationships) has been used, infamously, in the context of child soldiers. Former commander of the United Nations Assistance Mission for Rwanda Romeo Dallaire (2011) observed:

In traditional African societies, age always and still is greatly respected, and children simply do not disobey or cause trouble without risking instant discipline from elders. This feature of typical society has been ever more instilled in the child soldier through training, socialization and combat experiences. (p. 145)

This 'perversion of social norms' (Dallaire 2011:145) is certainly an example of the Whiteheadean observation (1933:259) of the ontological 'intermingling of Beauty and Evil.'

Impediments to wholeness must be included in the lived definition of ubuntu relational ontology if it is to account for the fullness of humanity. It is our thesis that such accounting extends an understanding of ubuntu past its foundationally-historic utopic impetus to also account for a noble sacrificial impetus, although welcomed, which bears unwelcomed collateral destruction, as, for example, witnessed in Kruidenier (2015):

Women experience several traditional practices of hospitality that are accompanied by risk of disease and violence and economic strains. These acts of hospitality and caring are acts of ubuntu in the community. (p. 5 of 7)

In the language of ubuntu, a true postfoundational unity of humanity includes, by definition, the paradoxical conjunction of welcomed and unwelcomed, moral and immoral, relations. Coetzee (2003) observes:

[*T*]here is no African philosophy which is not a product of cultural construction [and that] the moral domain admits a multiplicity of moral orders (there is no single moral order for all human beings). (p. 322)

The inclusion of unwelcomed behaviours and consequences in a postfoundational definition of ubuntu is a matter of integrity, wholeness of the application and relevance of the aphorism. A postfoundational claim for ubuntu is that it can, and must, include in its ontology and cosmology the unwelcomed and dystopic influences in a society or individuals that can find support in 'the very concern with authenticity in African philosophy [which] *presupposes* a background of crisis'. (Wiredu 2007:73; emphasis added)

Whitehead's (1978) relational category of 'concrescence' is:

[*T*]he process in which the universe of many things acquires an individual unity in a determinate relegation of each item of the 'many' to its subordination in the constitution of the novel [meaning the singularly newly-felt experience as] 'one'. (p. 211)

Process thought and ubuntu converge, again, on this following point. The coalescence of welcomed and unwelcomed experiences under the postfoundational epistemological umbrella of ubuntu into a unified experience presents intersubjectivities which 'blur the sharp distinction between what is universal and what is particular' (Whitehead 1978:48). The previously noted etymological study of both conjoined and distinct meanings of ubu and -ntu offers a free-standing independent yet concurring epistemology from the formative culture of ubuntu in this way: The nexus of the universal (ubu-) and the particular (-ntu) is the nexus of our 'morally ambivalent natures ... [m]oral awareness, [and] the depths of depravity' (Stone 2006:86).

This scene of personal collision bordering on elimination reflects the interdependence of wholeness and brokeness, of welcomed and the unwelcomed occasions – and persons – and reaches into the Whiteheadean observation of the existential prehension of the extended (i.e. extensive) transversality of the external (public) and the internal (private) datum of life. Such interrelatedness of conjunction and disjunction of external and internal, public and private, data is the experience of their nexus as the 'co-ordination of [those] prehensions' (Whitehead 1978:290).

The Whiteheadean 'concurrent realisation of a purpose towards elimination' (Emmet 1966:269) is the definition of evil and describes – with ubuntuesque echoes – 'how disturbingly intimate [is] the relationship between the oppressed and his or her oppressor, the self and the other' (Brink 1998:199).

We have seen congruent ontological and categorical harmony between 'process' and ubuntu. A closing example follows of the ontological intimacy that exists at the nexus of individuals and their communities of both relation and distance, prehensions

of interlocking positive (inculcated) and negative (held in abeyance) natures, and ultimately that 'there is no element in the universe capable of pure privacy' (Whitehead 1978:212).

One of many such nexus was recorded by Gobodo-Madikizela<sup>20</sup> which occurred at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's Committee on Human Rights Violations (TRC 1998). At one point of the proceedings, Winnie Madikizela-Mandela, once the 'embodiment of suffering, resistance, survival, and all the images associated with the fight against apartheid, was questioned as a perpetrator.' (Gobodo-Madikizela 2004:101).

It is in dystopic experiences that the reach between ubuntu and its transversal interlocutor of the philosophy of organism renders its most profound and unavoidable conduit for unwelcomed experiences. The presupposition of crisis in the formation of personal authenticity in the 'because' and 'through' of ubuntu was revealed in no less a scenario than during one particular 1997 prison interview with former South African Police Colonel Eugene de Kock by clinical psychologist Pumla Gobodo-Madikizela (2004):

Standing there stunned, in conversation with a broken man who had been an angel of death, I felt as if I were in the midst of a collision of scattered meanings within these prison walls that had enclosed our conversations. (p. 114)

At the TRC, Gobodo-Madikizela reported having experienced another a powerful example of the ubuntu-process relational ontologies' paradoxical co-mingling of 'relation and distance' (Louw 2001:26).

#### According to Gobodo-Madikizela:

[S]he (Madikizela-Mandela) approached Stompie Siepe's [sic] mother while the cameras rolled. With a triumphant smile and open arms, she embraced her. I watched the moment of contact between the two women: the mother's humble smile and return of the gesture, and Madikizela-Mandela's triumphant smile, enacting her imposing power through her embrace. Two smiles: one symbol of power, and the other a symbol of impotence. (Gobodo-Madikizela 2004:102)

#### Conclusion

The intimate relationship of oppressed with oppressor, the welcomed and the unwelcomed, is but one proof of the demand for a postfoundational ubuntu whose ontology and epistemology reflect the unity-amid-diversity that is the human condition.

20. Gobodo-Madikizela was a member of the TRC Committee on Human Rights Violations, established 16 December 1995, with public hearings beginning April 1996; its reports were presented to President Nelson Mandela 29 October 1998. Reports of open public hearings can be found in Truth and Reconciliation Report (TRC 1998).

Whitehead speaks of the spectrum of truly human nature that cannot be neatly subdivided to the welcomed and unwelcomed:

Nothing can be omitted, experience drunk and experience sober, experience waking, experience drowsy and experience wide-awake, experience self-conscious and experience self-forgetful, experience intellectual and experience physical, experience religious and experience sceptical, experience anxious and experience care-free, experience anticipatory and experience retrospective, experience happy and experience grieving, experience dominated by emotion and experience under self-restraint, experience in the light and experience in the dark, experience normal and experience abnormal. (Whitehead 1933:226)

Transversally spoken, a postfoundational ubuntu offers a language and experience in life that draws a community and each of its members into the fullest of being and becoming - where brokenness mingles with wholeness. Expressed in yet another translation: 'Your pain is My pain, My wealth is Your wealth, and Your salvation is My salvation' (Nussbaum 2003:21).

# ■ Summary: Chapter 6

This examination of ubuntu is engaged in a conversation with the speculative philosophy of organism ('process') to acquire an extended tool by which to engage within its ontology the widest possible range of human interaction. The engagement by ubuntu's relational doctrine of the speculative philosophical cosmology of A.N. Whitehead placed portions of the latter's constructs at the service of ubuntu's transversal capacity to examine and apply the deepest understanding of its own etymology. It has been a challenge to understand occasions of injustice and suffering which have manifested within the same African culture which has given to the world the language and concept of ubuntu. It has been commonplace to isolate the utopian relational ontology implicit in the aphorism from occasions of the worst of human nature. It was the premise of this study that an understanding of an ubuntu which excludes dystopian occasions has done a disservice to the breadth, depth and height of what is to be fully human – including occasions of suffering and anti-social behaviours.

# References

- August, K.T., 2005, 'Reconciliation in the South African political context: A challenge to the Church for community building', *Scriptura* 88, 14–29. http://dx.doi.org/10.7833/88-0-991
- Bedford-Strohm, H., Bataringaya, P. & Jahnichen, T. (eds.), 2016, Reconciliation and just peace: Impulses of the theology of Dietrich Bonhoeffer for the European and African context, Lit Verlag GmbH & Co. KG WIE, Zurich.
- Bernasconi, R. (ed.), 2003, Race and Racism in Continental Philosophy, Indiana University Press, Indiana.
- Bhattacharyya, G., Gabriel, J. & Small, S., 2003, Race and power. Global racism in the twenty-first century, Routledge, New York.
- Blumer, H., 1958, 'Race prejudice as a sense of group position', *Pacific Sociological Review* 1(1), 3–7. http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1388607
- Boesak, A., 1995, 'The Church and the RDP', in R. Koegelenberg (ed.), The reconstruction and development programme: The role of the Church, Civil society and NGO's, pp. 25–28, EFSA, Cape Town.
- 'Britain Grapples With Enduring Questions of Religion and Race', International New York Times, 26 April, 2016.
- Christerson, B., Edwards, K. & Emerson, M. (eds.), 2005, Against all odds: The struggle for racial integration in religious organizations, New York University Press, New York.
- Cross, M. & Keith, M., 1993, Racism, the city and the state, Routledge, New York.
- Darbyshire, H., 1994, Not in Norfolk: tackling the invisibility of racism, Norwich and Norfolk Racial Equality Council, Norwich.
- Derman-Sparks, L. & Phillips, C.B., 1997, *Teaching/learning anti-racism*, Teachers College Press, New York.
- Dietrich Bonhoeffer Werke, 2005, Ethics, in Clifford J. Green, transl. Reinhard Krauss, Charles West & Douglas W. Stott (eds.), Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Dixon, J.C., 2006, 'The ties that bind and those that don't: Towards reconciling group threat and contact theories of prejudice', *Social Forces* 84(4), 2179–2204. http://dx.doi.org/10.1353/sof.2006.0085
- Duncan, G., 2002, 'A place in the Sun? The role of the Church in moral renewal and social transformation', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 23(2), 333–342. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v23i2.1198
- Herring, C., 2011, Combatting racism and xenophobia: Transatlantic and international perspectives, Institute of Government Public Affairs, University of Illinois, Champaign, Illinois.
- Jordan, J., 1995, I was looking at the Ceiling and then I saw the Sky, Scribner, New York.

- Kleinschmidt, H., 1995, 'National development priorities for a new South Africa', in R. Koegelenberg (ed.), *Transition and transformation: A challenge to the Church*, pp. 173–176, EFSA, Cape Town.
- Lane, J., 1999, Action for racial equality in the early years: Understanding the past, thinking about the present, planning for the future, A Practical Handbook for Early Years Workers, National Early Years Network, London.
- Marsh, C., 2005, The beloved community: How faith shapes social justice, from the civil rights movement to today, Basic Books, New York.
- McLaren, L.M., 2003, 'Anti-Immigrant Prejudice in Europe: Contact, Threat Perception, and Preferences for the Exclusion of Migrant's, *Social Forces* 81(3), 909–936, Oxford Academic, Oxford.
- McLaren, P. & Torres, R. 1999, 'Racism and multicultural education: Rethinking "race" and "whiteness" inlate capitalism', in S. May (ed.), *Critical multiculturalism: Rethinking multicultural and antiracist education*, pp. 42–76, Falmer Press, Philadelphia.
- Pillay, J., 1996, Pupils from informal settlements in Indian secondary schools: Guidelines for educational psychologist, RAU, Johannesburg.
- Pillay, J., 2002, The Church and development in the new South Africa: Towards a theology of development, University of Cape Town, Cape Town.
- Pillay, J., 2014, 'Has democracy led to the demise of racism in South Africa? A search for the answer in Gauteng schools', Africa Education Review 11(2), 146–163. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/181466 27.2014.927147
- Rattansi, A., 2007, Racism a very short introduction, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Robinson, C.J., 1983, Black Marxism: The making of the black radical tradition, Zed Press, London.
- Semali, L., 1998, 'Perspectives on the curriculum of whiteness', in J. Kincheloe, S.R. Steinberg, N.M. Rodriquez & R.E. Chennault (eds.), *White reign: Deploying whiteness in America*, pp. 172–192, St Martin's Griffin, New York.
- Williams, E., 1964, Capitalism and slavery, Andre Deutsch, London.
- Williams, P., 1997, The genealogy of race: Towards a theory of grace, Reith Lectures, BBC, London.

- Blei, K., 1994, Apartheid as a status confessionis, Semper Reformanda, Geneva.
- Bonhoeffer, D., 1959, Letters and papers from prison, E. Bethge (ed.), Collins Fontana Books, London.
- Bonhoeffer, D., 1963, The cost of discipleship, Macmillan, New York.
- Bonhoeffer, D., [1933] 1965, 'The Church and the Jewish question', in E.H. Robinson & J. Bowden (eds.), No rusty swords: Letters, lectures and notes 1928–1936, pp. 226–235, Harper & Row, New York.
- Bonhoeffer, D., 1995, 'The structure of responsible life', in D. Bonhoeffer, *Ethics*, pp. 220–249, Harper & Row, New York.
- Bonhoeffer, D., (in press), 'Sermon on forgiveness (Matthew 18:21–25)', in D. Bonhoeffer, Gesammelte Schriften, E. Bethge (ed.), vol. 4, pp. 399–403, Chr. Kaiser Verlag, München. (Note: The English text may be found in Dietrich Bonhoeffer Works English [DBWE], editor V.J. Barnett, vol. 14, Fortress Press, Minneapolis, pp 197–204.)

Boraine, A., 2001, A country unmasked, Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Clements, K., 2006, Bonhoeffer and Britain, CCBI Publications, London.

De Gruchy, J.W., 1979, The Church struggle in South Africa, David Philip, Cape Town.

De Gruchy, J.W., 1984, Bonhoeffer and South Africa. Theology in dialogue, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.

De Gruchy, J.W., 2005, Daring, trusting spirit: Bonhoeffer's friend Eberhard Bethge, SCM, London.

Evangelical Church in Germany, 1999, 'Dietrich Bonhoeffer-Prize for the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *Bulletin 2*, viewed 05 January 2017, from https://www.ekd.de/english/1697-2699.html

Institute for Justice and Reconciliation (IJR), 2013, Confronting exclusion: Time for radical Reconciliation: SA Reconciliation Barometer Survey: 2013 Report, IJR, Cape Town.

Makele, B., 2011, 'Baptised in blood: Saint Manche Masemola', viewed 06 January 2017, from Desktop Commentaries/Documentary idea. www.desktop-documenatries.com/baptised-in-blood-saint-manche-masemola-documentary-idea.html

Mandela, N., 1994, Long walk to freedom, Macdonald Purnell, London.

Meiring, P., 1999, Chronicle of the Truth Commission, Carpe Diem, Vanderbijlpark.

Meiring, P., 2002, 'Unshackling the ghosts of the past', Missionalia 30, pp. 56–69.

Meiring, P., 2015, Dietrich Bonhoeffer and costly reconciliation in South Africa', paper delivered at the Bonhoeffer Consultation, Beyers Naudé Centre for Public Theology, University of Stellenbosch, 30 September–02 October.

Nürnberger, K. & Tooke, J. (eds.), 1988, *The cost of reconciliation in South Africa*, Methodist Publishing House, Cape Town. (N.I.R.Reader1)

Shapiro, J., 1997, Zapiro: The hole truth, David Philip, Cape Town.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa (TRC), 1998, Report, vols. 1–7, Juta, Cape Town.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa (TRC), 1998, Report, vol. 1, Juta, Cape Town.

Tutu, D., 1999, No future without forgiveness, Rider, London.

Uniting Reformed Church of Southern Africa, 2012, The Confession of Belhar, Acts of Synod 2012, pp. 767–770, URCSA, Cape Town. https://enWikipedia.org/wiki/BelharConfession

Van Vught, W. & Cloete, D., 2000, Race and reconciliation in South Africa, Lexington Books, Lanham.

Villa-Vicencio, C. & De Gruchy, J.W. (eds.), 1985, Resistance and hope, South African essays in honour of Beyers Naudé, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.

Wale, K., 2013, Confronting exclusion: Time for radical reconciliation: SA Reconciliation barometer survey, report, Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, n.p.

Westminster Abbey, n.d., '20th century martyrs', viewed 25 May 2015, from https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Westminster\_Abbey\_-\_20th-century\_Martyrs.jpeg

# Chapter 3

Berlin, A., 2010, 'Legal fiction: Levirate *cum* land redemption in Ruth', *Journal of Ancient Judaism* 1(1), 3–18. http://dx.10.13109/jaju.2010.1.1.3

- Braulik, G., 1996, 'Das Deuteronomium und die Bücher Ijob, Sprichwörter, Rut', in E. Zenger (Hrsg.), Die Tora als Kanon für Juden und Christen, pp. 61–138, Herder, Freiburg.
- Braulik, G., 1999, 'The Book of Ruth as Intra-Biblical critique on the Deuteronomic Law', *Acta Theologica* (1), 1–20.
- Cohn Eskenasi, T. & Frymer-Kensky, T., 2011, Ruth, The Jewish Publication Society, Philadelphia.
- De Vaux, R., 1988, Ancient Israel. Its life and institutions, transl. J. McHugh, Darton, Longman & Todd, London.
- Doob Sakenfeld, K., 1999, Ruth. Interpretation. A Bible commentary for teaching and Preaching, John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Fischer, I., 1995, Gottestreiterinnen. Biblische Erzählungen über die Anfänge Israels, Kohlhammer, Stuttgart.
- Fischer, I., 1999, 'The Book of Ruth. A "Feminist" Commentary to the Torah' in A. Brenner (ed.), Ruth and Esther. A feminist companion to the Bible, 2nd series, pp. 24–44, Sheffield Academic Press, Sheffield.
- Fischer, I., 2001, Rut, Herder, Freiburg im Breisgau.
- Frevel, C., 1992, Das Buch Rut, Verlag Katholisches Bibelwerk, Stuttgart.
- Frevel, C., 2009, "Du wirst jemand haben, der dein Herz erfreut und dich im Alter versorgt" (Rut 4:15). Alter und Altersversorgung im Alten/Ersten Testament', in R. Kampling & A. Middelbeck-Varwick (Hrsg.), *Alter Blicke auf das bevorstehende Apeliotes*, pp. 11–43, Peter Lang, Frankfurt am Main. (Studien zur Kulturgeschichte und Theologie, 4).
- Goulder, D., 1993, 'A homily on Deuteronomy 22–25?', in H.A. McKay & D.J.A. Clines (eds.), Of prophets' visions and the wisdom of sages. Essays in Honour of R. Norman Whybray on his seventieth birthday, pp. 307–319, JSOT Press, Sheffield.
- Gow, M.D., 1992, The Book of Ruth. Its structure, theme and purpose, Apollos, Leicester.
- Grant, R., 1991, 'Literary structure in the Book of Ruth', *Bibliotheca Sacra* 148, pp. 425–443, viewed 24 April 2013, from http://www.ancientpath.net/Bible/OT/08\_ruth/Addendum/
- Grätz, S., 2007, 'Second Temple and the legal status of the Torah: The hermeneutics of the Torah in the Books of Ruth and Ezra', in G.N. Knoppers & B.M. Levinson (eds.), *The Pentateuch as Torah. New models for understanding its promulgation and acceptance*, pp. 273–287, Eisenbrauns, Winona Lake.
- Halton, C., 2012, 'An indecent proposal: The theological core of the Book of Ruth', *Scandinavian Journal of the Old Testament* 26(1), 30–43.
- Hamlin, J., 1996, Surely there is a future. A commentary on the Book of Ruth, Wm B Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Köhlmoos, M., 2010, Ruth, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Göttingen.
- Korpel, M.C.A., 2001, The structure of the Book of Ruth, Koninklijke Van Gorcum, Assen.
- LaCocque, A., 1990, The Feminine unconventional. Four subversive figures in Israel's tradition, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- LaCocque, A., 2004, Ruth, transl. K.C. Hanson, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.

- Lau, P.H.W., 2011, Identity and ethics in the Book of Ruth. A social identity approach, De Gruyter, Berlin.
- Loader, J.A., 1994, Ruth. Een praktische bijbelverklaring, Uitgeverij Kok, Kampen.
- Matthews, V., 2004, Judges and Ruth, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Moen Saxegaard, K., 2010, Character complexity in the Book of Ruth, Mohr Siebeck, Tübingen.
- Neuman, K., 2006, s.v. 'Name', in A. Berlejung & C. Frevel (Hrsg.), Handbuch theologischer Grundbegriffe zum Alten und Neuen Testament, pp. 325–327, Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, Darmstadt.
- Nielsen, K., 1997, Ruth: A commentary, transl. E. Broadbridge, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Prinsloo, W.S., 1982, Die Boek Rut, NG Kerk-Uitgewers, Kaapstad.
- Siquans, A., 2009, 'Foreignness and poverty in the Book of Ruth. A legal way for a poor foreign woman to be integrated into Israel', *Journal for Biblical Literature* 3, 443–452.
- Spangenberg, I., 2000, 'The literature of the Persian Period (539–333 BCE)', in W. Boshoff,
  E. Scheffler & I. Spangenberg (eds.), Ancient Israelite literature in context, pp. 168–198,
  Protea Boekhuis, Pretoria.
- Wetter, A-M., 2014, 'Ruth: A born-again Israelite? One woman's journey through space and time', in E. Ben Zvi & D.V. Edelman (eds.), *Imagining the Other and constructing Israelite identity in the Early Second Temple Period*, pp. 144–162, Bloomsbury, London.
- Wuench, H-G., 2014, 'The stranger in God's Land foreigner, stranger, guest: What can we learn from Israel's attitude towards strangers?', Old Testament Essays 27(3), 1129–1154.
- Zakovitch, Y., 1999, *Das Buch Rut. Ein jüdischer Kommentar*, Verlag Katholisches Bibelwerk, Stuttgart. Zenger, E., 1986, *Das Buch Ruth*, Theologischer Verlag, Zürich.

- Bosch, D.J., 1991, Transforming mission, Orbis Books, New York.
- Caruth, C. (ed.), 1995, Trauma. Explorations in memory, The Johns Hopkins University Press, London.
- Cole, C.M., 2007, 'Performance, transitional justice and the Law: South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *Theatre Journal* 59(2), 167–187.
- Cole, C.M., 2010, Performing South Africa's Truth Commission: Stages of transition, Indiana University Press, Bloomingdale.
- Collins English Dictionary, 2011, HarperCollins, Glasgow.
- Cruywagen, V., 2014, 'Tutu to lead debate on TRC hearings', *The New Age*, viewed 01 October 2014, from www.pressreader.com/south-africa/the-new-age-western-cape/.../281638188432555
- De Gruchy, J. & De Gruchy, S., 2005, The church struggle in South Africa, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Doxtader, E. (ed.), 2005, Provoking questions: An assessment of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's recommendations and their implementation, Institute for Justice and Reconciliation, Cape Town.

- Du Toit, F., 2014, 'Reconciliation within a local context', report of the Symposium on the challenges of reconciliation in a post TRC South Africa, 11–12 February 2014, pp. 2–5, Stellenbosch University, Stellenbosch.
- Hall, G., 2003, 'Multi-faith dialogue in conversation with Raimon Panikkar', paper presented at the annual conference of the Australian Association for the Study of Religions. Griffith University, Brisbane, 3–6 July, pp. 1–10, viewed 16 August 2016, from http://dlibrary.acu.edu.au/staffhome/gehall/Hall\_Panikkar.htm
- Hall, G., 2007, 'Prophetic dialogue as a Practical Theological category', *Australian eJournal of Theology* 10, pp. 1–10, viewed 26 July 2016, from http://aejt.com.au/2007/issue\_10
- Hutten, P.H., 2004, 'Memories of trauma: Problems of interpretation', History and theory, 43(2), 249-259.
- Kroeger, J.H., 2008, 'The Faith-culture dialogue in Asia: Ten FABC insights on inculturation', *Studia Missionalia* 57(10), 78–93.
- Lapsley, M., 2014, 'Healing of personal and communal memories', viewed 29 August 2015, from http://www.healing-memories.org/news/speeches/healing-of-personal-and-communal-memories
- Meiring, P., 1999, Chronicle of the Truth Commission, Carpe Diem Books, Vanderbijlpark.
- Miskotte, H.H., 1992, Pastor & profeet, Kok ten Have, Baarn.
- Panikkar, R., 1995: Cultural disarmament: The way to peace, Westminster John Know Press, Louisville.
- Rosoux, V., 2013, 'Is reconciliation negotiable?', International Negotiation 18, 471-493.
- Thesnaar, C.H., 2013, 'Reformed Churches struggle for justice: Lessons learnt from their submissions before the TRC', Nederduits Gereformeerde Teologiese Tydskrif 54(3 & 4), 54–66.
- Thesnaar, C.H., 2014, 'Seeking feasible reconciliation: A transdisciplinary contextual approach to reconciliation', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 70(2), 1–8.
- Thesnaar, C.H., 2015, 'Report on the re-enactment of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's faith hearing consultation', Stellenbosch University, Stellenbosch, 08–09 October 2014.
- The Truth & Reconciliation Commission of South Africa (TRC), 1998a, Report, vol. 1, Juta, Cape Town.
- The Truth & Reconciliation Commission of South Africa (TRC), 1998b, Report, vol. 4, Juta, Cape Town.
- Vosloo, R., 2015, 'Time in our time: On theology and future-oriented memory', Inaugural lecture delivered at Stellenbosch University, Stellenbosch, 05 May, pp. 1–15.
- Wale, K., 2013, 'Confronting exclusion: Time for radical reconciliation, SA Reconciliation Barometer Survey: 2013', viewed 15 April 2015, from http://reconciliationbarometer.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/12/IJR-Barometer-Report-2013-22Nov1635.pdf
- Weinrich, H., 1999, Léthé. Art et critique de l'oubli, Fayard, Paris.

- Anderson, B., 1991, Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism, rev. edn., Verso, London.
- Brown, V., 1996, 'The emergence of the economy', in S. Hall, D. Held, D. Hubert & K. Thompson (eds.), *Modernity: An introduction to modern societies*, pp. 90–118, Blackwell, Oxford.

- Burke, P.T., 2010, 'The origin of social justice: Taparelli, D'Azeglio', viewed 13 April 2016, from https://home.isi.org/origins-social-justice-taparelli-d%E2%80%99azeglio
- Dube, Z., 2013, 'Teaching the Bible at public universities in South Africa: A proposal for multidisciplinary approach', HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies 69(1), Art. #1295, 6 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v69i1.1295
- Dube, Z., 2016, 'The African women theologians' contribution towards the discussion about alternative masculinities', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 37(2), 6 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v37i2.1577
- Elliott, J.H., 2002, 'Jesus was not an egalitarian. A critique of an anachronistic and idealist theory', *Biblical Theology Bulletin* 32(2), 75–91.
- Elliott, M., 2007, 'Human rights and the triumph of the individual in world culture', *Cultural Sociology* 1(3), 343–363.
- Fukuyama, F., 1989, The end of history, The National Interest 16, 3–18.
- Giddens, A., 1990, The consequences of modernity, Polity Press, Cambridge.
- Gutierrez, G., 1973, A Theology of liberation, Orbis Books, Maryknoll.
- Hall, S., 1996, The west and the rest: Discourse and power, in S. Hall, D. Held, D. Hubert & K. Thompson (eds.), *Modernity: An introduction to modern societies*, pp. 184–224, Blackwell, Oxford.
- Held, D., 1996, 'The development of the modern state', in S. Hall, D. Held, D. Hubert & K. Thompson (eds.), *Modernity: An introduction to modern societies*, pp. 55–84, Blackwell, Oxford.
- Horkheimer, M. & Adorno, T., 1972, The dialectic of enlightenment, Herder & Herder, New York.
- Horsley, R., 2001, Hearing the whole story: A political plot in Mark's Gospel, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Jameson, F., 1991, Postmodernism or the cultural logic of late capitalism, Verso, London.
- Levine, L., 1992, 'Introduction' in L. Levive (ed.), *The Galilee in late antiquity*, pp. xvii-3, Harvard University Press, Cambridge.
- Lyotard, J.F., 1993, *Libidinal economy*, transl. I. Hamilton Grant, Indiana University Press, Bloomington.
- McGrew, A., 1996, 'The state in advanced capitalist society', in S. Hall, D. Held, D. Hubert & K. Thompsom (eds.), *Modernity: An introduction to modern societies*, pp. 239–275, Blackwell, Oxford.
- Moxnes, H., 2003, Putting Jesus in his place, a radical vision of household and kingdom, Knox Press, Westminster.
- Myers, C., 1991, Binding the strong man: A political reading of Mark's story of Jesus, Orbis Books, Maryknoll.
- Neyrey, H.J., 1995, 'Loss of wealth, loss of family and loss of honour', in P. Esler (ed.), Modelling early Christianity: Social-scientific studies of the new testament in its context, pp. 129–138, Routledge, London.
- Nortje-Meyer, L., 2002, 'The homosexual body without apology: A positive link between the Canaanite woman in Matthew 15:21–28 and homosexual interpretation of biblical texts', *Religion & Theology* 9(1–2), 118–134.
- Offe, C., 1984, Contradiction of the welfare state, Hutchinson, London.

- Porter, R., 1990, The enlightenment, Macmillan, London.
- Raborife, M., 2016, 'Ethical leaders leave no room for corruption', viewed 12 April 2016, from http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/an-ethical-leader-leaves-no-room-for-corruption-mogoeng-20160411
- Rasmussen, L.L., 2005, Dietrich Bonhoeffer: Reality and resistance, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Rohrbaugh, R.L., 1995, 'Legitimating sonship: A test of honour: a social scientific study of Luke 4:1–30', in P. Esler (ed.), *Modelling early Christianity: Social-scientific studies of the new testament in its context*, pp. 183–197, Routledge, London.
- Scott, J., 1990, Domination and the arts of resistance: Hidden transcripts, Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Smith, A., 1976, 'An inquiry into the nature and causes of the wealth of nations', in R.H. Cambel & A.S. Skinner, (eds.), The Glasgow edition of the work and correspondence of Adam Smith, vol. 2, pp. 15–18, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Sobrino, J., 2005, Jesus the liberator: A historical theological reading of Jesus of Nazareth, Orbis, New York.
- Strange, S., 2002, The declining power of the state, in D. Held & A. McGrew (eds.), *The global transformation reader: an introduction to globalisation debate*, pp. 121–127, Polity, Cambridge.
- Tandwa, L., 2016, 'Please resign, church leaders ask Zuma', viewed 12 April 2016, from http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/please-resign-church-leaders-ask-zuma-20160408
- Thompson, E.P., 1971, 'The moral economy of English crowd in the eighteenth century', *Past and Present* 1, 76–136.
- Touraine, A., 1971, The post-industrial society: Tomorrow's social history, class, conflict and culture in the programmed society, Random House, New York.
- Weber, M., [1930] 1992, The protestant ethic and the spirit of capitalism, Routledge, London.

- Brink, A., 1998, Reinventing a continent: Writing and politics in South Africa, Zoland, Cambridge.
- Coetzee, P.H., 2003, 'Morality in African thought', in P.H. Coetzee & P.J. Roux (eds.), *The African philosophy reader: A text with readings*, 2nd. edn., pp. 321–336, Routledge, London.
- Dallaire, R., 2011, They fight like soldiers, they die like children: The global quest to eradicate the use of child soldiers, Vintage, Toronto.
- De Beer, S.F., 2015, 'Ubuntu is homeless: An urban theological reflection', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36(2), Art #1471, 12 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v3612.1471
- Emmet, D., 1966, Whitehead's philosophy of organism, 2nd edn., MacMillan, London.
- Forster, D.A., 2006, 'Identity in relationship: The ethics of ubuntu as an answer to the impasse of individual consciousness', paper presented at the South African Science and Religion forum, in C.W. du Toit (ed.), *The impact of knowledge systems on human development in Africa*, pp. 245–289, Research Institute for Religion and Theology, University of South Africa, Pretoria, viewed 16 October 2008, from http://www.spirituality.org.za/.../ubuntu%20and%20identity%20D%20 Forster%202006.doc

- Forster, D.A., 2010a, 'African relational ontology, individual identity, and Christian Theology: An African theological contribution towards an integrated relational ontological identity', *Theology,* July–August, 113(874), 243–253.
- Forster, D.A., 2010b, 'A generous ontology: Identity as a process of intersubjective discovery an African theological contribution', *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 66(1), Art. #731, 12 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v66i1.731
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2004, A human being died that night: A South African woman confronts the legacy of Apartheid, Mariner, Boston.
- Harari, Y.N., 2014, Sapiens: A brief history of humankind, transl. H. Yur, Signal, n.p.
- Kanu, I.A., 2013, 'The dimensions of African cosmology', Filosofia Theoretica: Journal of African Philosophy, Culture and Religion 1(2) July–December, 533–555, viewed 20 May 2015, from http:// africanphilcongress.com/vol2no2/KANU-THE%20DIMENSIONS%20OF%20AFRICAN%20 COSMOLOGY%20FT%202-2%202013.pdf
- Kruidenier, R., 2015, 'Trying for better circumstances (Zama Zama): Exploring *ubuntu* amongst marginalised women in an informal settlement', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36(2), Art. #1433, 7 pages, viewed 15 July 2015, from http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v3612.1433
- Loubser, G.M., 2012, 'The shared resources of rational agents: Van Huyssteen's postfoundationalist facilitation of interdisciplinarity', in C.W. du Toit (ed.), *Knowing, believing, living in Africa: Perspectives from science and religion*, pp. 85–105, Research Institute for Theology and Religion University of South Africa, Pretoris, viewed 31 August 2016, from http://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/7056/Loubser%201.pdf?sequence=1
- Louw, D.J., 2001, 'Ubuntu and the challenges of multiculturalism in post-apartheid South Africa', *QUEST: An African Journal of Philosophy* 15(1&2), 15–36, viewed 13 July 2015, from http://www.quest-journal.net/Quest\_2001\_PDF/louw.pdf
- Louw, D.J., 2010, 'Power sharing and the challenge of ubuntu ethics', in C. du Toit, (ed.), *Power sharing and African democracy: Interdisciplinary perspectives*, Research Institute for Theology and Religion, Unisa, Pretoria, viewed 13 January 2014 from http://uir.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/4316/Louw.pdf?sequence=1
- Makgoba, M., 2014, 'African Universities or Universities in Africa: Educators consider how much institutions in developing nations should focus on local priorities as opposed to research agendas that match those in the West'. Reportage by Jack Grove, *Inside Higher Ed.*, viewed 01 September 2016, from https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2014/12/11/south-african-academic-calls-african-universities-resist-priorities-west
- Müller, J.C., 2015, "Exploring "nostalgia" and "imagination" for ubuntu research: A postfoundationalist perspective', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36(2), Art. #1432, 6 pages, viewed 24 July 2015, from http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v3612.1432
- Nkhata, M.J., (2010), 'Rethinking governance and constitutionalism in Africa: The relevance and viability of social trust-based governance and constitutionalism in Malawi', LLD dissertation, Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria.
- Nussbaum, B., 2003, 'Ubuntu: Reflections of a South African on our common humanity', *Reflections* 4(4), 21–26.

- Ramose, M.B., 2001 'An African perspective on justice and race, polylog', Forum for Intercultural Philosophy 3, viewed 25 February 2015, from http://them.polylog.org/3/frm-en.htm
- Ramose, M.B., 2003, 'Discourses on Africa', in P.H. Coetzee & P.J. Roux (eds.), *The African Philosophy Reader: A text with readings*, 2nd edn., pp. 1–9, Routledge, London, viewed 15 May 2012, from http://www.docstoc.com/docs/81721439/?
- Reynhout, K.A., 2011, 'The hermeneutics of transdisciplinarity: A Gadamerian model of transversal reasoning', Metanexus Institute, New York, viewed 31 August 2016, from http://www.metanexus.net/essay/hermeneutics-transdisciplinarity-gadamerian-model-transversal-reasoning
- Schrag, C.O., 1994, 'Transversal rationality' in T.J. Stapleton (ed.), *The question of hermeneutics: Essays in Honor of Joseph J. Kockelmans*, pp. 61–78, Springer Science+Business Media, Dordrecht.
- Seibt, J., 2005, 'Process ontologies', in G. Imaguire (ed.), Metafisica e Ontologia, pp. 1–27, Philosophia Verlag, München, viewed 07 September 2015, from https://www.academia.edu/460451/ Process\_Ontologies
- Seibt, J. 2009, 'Forms of emergent interaction in General Process Theory', Synthese 166, 479–512, Springer Science+Business Media, Dordrecht, viewed 07 September 2015, from http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11229-008-9373-z
- Shakespeare, W., 2003–2005, *Hamlet*, Originally from Open Source Shakespeare, Act III, Scene 1, viewed 01 September 2016, form http://www.opensourceShakespeare.org
- Stone, J.A., 2006, 'Van Huyssteen in context: A comparison with Philip Hefner and Karl Peters', in F.L. Shultz (ed.), *The evolution of rationality: Interdisciplinary essays in honor of J. Wentzel Van Huyssteen*, pp. 3–86, William B. Eerdmans Publishing, Grand Rapids.
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa (TRC), 1998, Report, vol. 4, Juta, Cape Town, viewed 06 January 2017, from http://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/Volume%204.pdf
- Van Huyssteen, J.W., 1998, 'Duet or duel: Theology and science in a postmodern world', Lectures for the 1998 Diocese of British Columbia John Albert Hall Lectures, Centre for Studies in Religion and Society in the University of Victoria, Trinity Press International, Harrisburg.
- Van Huyssteen, J.W., 2000, 'Postfoundationalism and interdisciplinarity: A response to Jerome Stone', Zygon 35(2), June, 427–439.
- Van Huyssteen, J.W., 2005, Alone in the world? Human uniqueness in science and theology, Eerdman, Grand Rapid, viewed 01 February 2016, from http://www.giffordlectures.org/lectures/alone-world-human-uniqueness-science-and-theology
- Wiredu, K., 2007, 'Philosophy and authenticity', *Shibboleths: A Journal of Comparative Theory* 1(2), 72–80. Whitehead, A.N., 1933, *Adventures of Ideas*, The Free Press, New York.
- Whitehead, A.N., 1978, *Process and reality: An essay in cosmology,* corrected edn., D.R. Griffin, D. Sherburne & D.W. Sherburne (eds.), The Free Press, New York.

Adams, S.L., 2010, s.v. 'Book of Proverbs', in J.J. Collins & D.C. Harlow (eds.), *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*, pp. 1102–1103, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Grand Rapids.

- Albertz, R., 1992, Religionsgeschichte Israels in alttestamentlicher Zeit, Teil 2, Vom Exil bis zu den Makkabäern, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Göttingen.
- Boccaccini, G., 2002, Roots of Rabbinic Judaism. An intellectual history, from Ezekiel to Daniel, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Brueggemann, W., 1997, Theology of the Old Testament. Testimony, dispute, advocacy, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Clifford, R.J., 2009, s.v. 'Proverbs, Book of in *The New Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible, Me-R*, Abingdon Press, Nashville, vol. 4, pp. 655–660.
- Collins, A.Y., 1996, Cosmology and eschatology in Jewish and Christian Apocalypticism, E.J. Brill, Leiden.
- Collins, J.J., 1993, Daniel. A commentary of the Book of Daniel, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Collins, J.J., 2004, Introduction to the Hebrew Bible, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Collins, J.J. & Harlow, D.C., 2010, *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Grand Rapids.
- Crenshaw, J.L., 1998, Old Testament Wisdom. An introduction, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- DiTomasso, L., 2010, s.v. 'Daniel, Book of, in J.J. Collins & D.C. Harlow (eds.), *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*, pp. 513–516, Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Grand Rapids.
- Ferguson, K., 2011, Stephen Hawking. His life and work, Bantam Books, London.
- Fox, M.V., 2008, Proverbs 1–9: A new translation with introduction and commentary, Logos edn., Anchor Bible 18A, Yale University Press, London.
- Goff, M., 2010, s.v. 'Wisdom literature', in J.J. Collins & D.C. Harlow (eds.), *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*, pp. 1339–1342, Wm B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Grand Rapids.
- Goldingay, J.E., 1998, *Daniel*, Logos edn., Word Incorporated, Dallas. (Word Biblical Commentary 30)
- Hanson, P.D., 1979, 'The Dawn of Apocalyptic, rev. edn., Fortress Press, Philadelphia.
- Hanson, P.D., 1985, s.v. 'Apocalyptic literature', in D.A. Knight & G.M. Tucker (eds.), *The Hebrew Bible and its modem interpreters*, Fortress, Philadelphia, pp. 465–488.
- Hellholm, D., 1986, 'The problem of Apocalyptic genre and the Apocalypse of John', *Semeia* 36, 13–64.
- Kok, J. (Kobus), 2015, 'The radicality of early Christian oikodome: A theology that edifies insiders and outsiders', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36(3), 12 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/VE.V36I3.1441d
- Loader, J.A., 2014, *Proverbs 1–9*, Historical commentary on the Old Testament, Peeters, Leuven. (Historical Commentary on the Old Testament)
- Matthews, V.H., Chavalas, M.W. & Walton, J.H., 2000, *The IVP Bible background commentary: Old Testament*, Logos edn., Inter Varsity Press, Downers Grove.
- Meadows, D.H., Meadows, D.L., Randers, J., Behrens W.B., III, 1972, The limits of growth. A report for the Club of Rome's project on the predicament of Mankind, Universe Books, New York.

- Murphy, R.E., 1966, 'The kerygma of the Book of Proverbs', *Interpretation* 20, 3–14.
- Murphy, R.E., 1998, *Proverbs*, Logos edn., Dallas, Word, Incorporated. Word Biblical Commentary, 22)
- Murphy, R.E. & Huwiler, E., 2012, *Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, Song of Songs,* Baker Books, Grand Rapids, MI. (Understanding the Bible Commentary Series)
- Nelson, W.B., 2013, Daniel, Logos edn., Baker Books, Grand Rapids.
- Rowland, C., 2010, s.v 'Apocalypticism' in J.J. Collins & D.C. Harlow (eds.), *The Eerdmans Dictionary of Early Judaism*, pp. 345–348, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Grand Rapids.
- Shakespeare Quick Quotes, viewed 11 April 2016, from http://www.shakespeareonline.com/quickquotes/quickquotehamletdreamt.html
- Toy, C.H., 1899, A critical and exegetical commentary on the Book of Proverbs, T&T Clark, Edinburgh. (The International Critical Commentary)
- Venter, P.M., 1981, 'Spreuke, wysheid en lewe in Spreuke een tot nege [Proverbs, Wisdom and sayings in Proverbs 1–9]', DD Thesis, Department Old Testament Studies, Faculty of Theology (Section A), University of Pretoria.
- Venter, P.M., 1997, 'Daniel and Enoch: Two different reactions', Hervormde Teologiese Studies, 53 (1&2), 68-91.
- Venter, P.M., 2000, 'Understanding the concept of "time" in Daniel', Skrif en Kerk 21(3), 666-681.
- Venter, P.M., 2001, 'Violence and non-violence in Daniel', Old Testament Essays 14(2), 311-329.
- Venter, P.M., 2002, 'The connection between wisdom literature, apocalypses and canon', *Old Testament Essays* 15(2), 470–488.
- Venter, P.M., 2007, 'Daniel 9: A Penitential Prayer in Apocalyptic Garb', in M.J. Boda, D.K. Falk & R.A. Werline (eds.), Seeking the favor of God, vol. 2, The Development of Penitential Prayer in Second Temple Judaism, pp. 33–49, Early Judaism and its Literature, Society of Biblical Literature, Atlanta.
- Venter, P.M., 2012, 'Trito-Isiah, penitential prayer and apocalypticism, *Verbum et Ecclesia* 33(1), Art #718, 12 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v33i1.718
- Venter, P.M., 2016, Review of 'Proverbs 1-9', by J.A. Loader, Peeters, Leuven, 2014', (Historical Commentary on the Old Testament), HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies 72(3), Art. #3385, 8 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v72i3.3385

- Du Toit, P.R., Hormeyr, J.W., Strauss, P.J. & Van der Merwe, J.M., 2002, Moeisame pad na vernuwing: Die NG Kerk se pad van isolasie en die soeke na nuwe relevansie 1974–2002, Barnabas, Bloemfontein.
- Gaum, F.M., 1994, 'Versoening', Die Kerkbode 154(17), 1.
- Gaum, F.M., 1997, 'Korrespondensie', 27 Augustus.
- Gaum, F.M., 2014a, epos, 20 Mei 2014, fritsgaum@telkomsa.net

- Gaum, F.M., 2014b, epos, 28 September 2014, fritsgaum@telkomsa.net
- Jonker, W., 1998, Selfs die Kerk kan verander, Tafelberg, Kaapstad.
- Kok, J., 2015, 'The radicality of early Christian oikodome: A theology that edifies insiders and outsiders', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36(3), 12 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v36i3.1441
- Labuschagne, K., 2013, 'A hermeneutical reflection on the resurrection of Jesus Christ in question and answer 45 of the Heidelberg Catechism', *In die Skriflig/In Luce Verbi* 47(2), Art #709, 10 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ids.v47i2.709
- Meiring, P.J.G., 1999, Kroniek van die waarheidskommissie, Carpe Diem, Vanderbijlpark.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk (NGK), 1990a, Dagbestuur, Notule, 26 November, Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk (NGK), 1990b, 'Handelinge van die Algemene Sinode', Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk (NGK), 1991, 'Dagbestuur van die Algemene Sinodale Kommissie 5–6 November', Bylaag 2/1, Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk (NGK), 1993a, Algemene Sinodale Kommissie, Agenda, 5–6 November, Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk (NGK), 1993b, 'Dagbestuur van die Algemene Sinodale Kommissie', Notule 5–6 November, Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk, 1994, 'Handelinge van die Algemene Sinode', Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk, 1997a, 'Algemene Sinodale Kommissie, Notule, 28 Oktober', Argief van die Algemene Sinode, Pretoria.
- Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk, Algemene Sinode, 1997b, Die verhaal van die NGK se reis met apartheid, Hugenote Uitgewers, Wellington.
- Odendaal, F.F., 1985, Verklarende Handwoordeboek van die Afrikaanse Taal, Perskor, Pretoria.
- Pillay, J., 2015, 'An exploration of the view of ecodomy in Calvin's view of God and its world: Its implications for churches in South Africa today', *Verbum et Ecclesia* 36(3), Art.#1474. 8 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v36i3.1474
- Potgieter, P.C., 2013, 'Persoonlike onderhoud', 04 November, Wildernis, Weskaap.
- Sparks, A., 1995, Tomorrow is another country, Jonathan Ball Publishers, Johannesburg.
- Strauss, P.J., 2013, Kerkwees in die branding: Die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk in Algemene Sinodale verband 1994–2011, SUN Media, Bloemfontein. (Acta Theologica Supplementum 18)
- Swanepoel, F., 1997, 'Moderator: Om nou net te swyg sou dwaas wees', Beeld, 14 Februarie, bl. 13.
- Swanepoel, F., 2014a, epos, 20 Mei, fmks@vodamail.co.za
- Swanepoel, F., 2014b, 'Persoonlike onderhoud', 29 Mei, 2014, Strand, Weskaap.
- Van der Merwe, J.M., 1990, 'Kerk en samelewing en ras, volk en nasie as beleidstukke van die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk 'n kerkhistoriese studie', DD Proefskrif, Universiteit van Pretoria.

Van der Watt, P.B., 1987, Die Nederduitse Gereformeerde Kerk 1905-1975, NG Kerkboekhandel, Pretoria.

Viljoen, C., 2014, 'Persoonlike onderhoud', 07 Junie, Orighstad, Mpumalanga.

- Ackermann, D.M., 2003, After the locusts: Letters from a landscape of faith, William. B. Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Ackermann, D.M., 2011, 'On being a theologian "for others", in L. Hansen, N. Koopman & R. Vosloo (eds.), *Living theology. Essays presented to Dirk J. Smit on his sixtieth birthday*, pp. 3–15, Bible Media, Wellington.
- Adams, A.K.M., 1995, What is postmodern biblical criticism?, Fortress Press, Minneapolis, MN.
- Bentham, J., 1995, The panopticon writings, M. Bosovic (ed.), Verso, London.
- Betti, E., 1980, Hermeneutics as the general methodolgy of the Geisteswissenschaften in Essays presented to Dirk J. Smit on his sixtieth birthday, pp. 3–15, Bible Media, Wellington.
- Caputo, J., 1987, Radical hermeneutics, Indiana University Press, Indianapolis.
- Cavanaugh, W.T., Bailey, J.W. & Hovey, C. (eds.), 2012, An Eerdmans reader in contemporary political theology, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Collins, S., 2008, The Hunger Games, Scholastic Press, New York.
- Collins, S., 2009, Catching fire, Scholastic Press, New York.
- Collins, S., 2010, Mockingjay, Scholastic Press, New York.
- De Vries, H. & Sullivan, L.E. (eds.), 2006, Political theologies: Public religions in a post-secular world, Fordham University Press, New York.
- Dreyer, Y., 2003, 'n Teoretiese inleiding tot narratiewe hermeneutiek in die teologie', HTS Theological/Teologiese Studies 59(2), 313–332.
- Dube, M.W., 2000, Postcolonial feminist interpretation of the Bible, Chalice Press, St. Louis.
- Epictetus, [AD 1–2] 2001, 'Dissertationes ab Arriano digestae 1.16.20–21', in A.A. Long, Epictetus: A Stoic and Socratic guide to life, pp. 7–38, Department of Classics, University of California, Berkeley.
- Eye Witness News (EWN), 2016, 'Tuks lectures cancelled as protests continue', 22 February 2016, viewed 05 June 2016, from http://ewn.co.za/2016/02/22/Tuks-Lectures-cancelled-as-protests-continue
- Gadamer, H-G., [1960] 1994, Truth and method, 2nd. rev. edn., Continuum, New York.
- Gadamer, H-G., 1996, The Relevance of the beautiful, R. Bernasconi (ed.), transl. N. Walker, Cambridge University Press, New York.
- Gadamer, H-G., 2004, A Century of philosophy, transl. R. Coltman & S. Koepke, Continuum, New York.
- Garbett, C.F., 1915, The work of a great parish, Church of England, London.

- Goldberg, M., 1981–1982, Theology and narrative: A critical introduction, Abingdon, Nashville.
- Grondin, J., 2001, *Play, festival and ritual in Gadamer: On the theme of the immemorial in his later works*, Musikverlag Bernd Katzbichler, Salzburg.
- Habermas, J., 1990, 'A Review of Gadamer's "Truth and Method", in G.L. Ormiston & A.D. Schrift (eds.), *The Hermeneutic tradition: From Ast to Ricouer*, pp.213–244, Suny Press, Albany.
- Hirsch, E.D., 1967, Validity in interpretation, Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Isasi-Díaz, A.M., [1996] 2012, 'Mujerista Theolgy: A challenge to traditional theology', in W.T. Cavanaugh, J.W. Bailey & C. Hovey, Eerdmans Reader in contemporary political theology, pp.418–437, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Itao, A.D.S., 2010, 'Paul Ricoeur's hermeneutics of symbols: A critical dialectic of suspicion and faith', *Kritike* 4(2), 1–17, viewed 18 May 2015, from http://www.kritike.org/journal/issue\_8/itao\_december2010.pdf
- Jüngel, E., 1974, 'Metaphorische Wahrheit. Erwägungen zur theologischen Relevanz der Metaphor als Beitrag zur Hermeneutik einer narrativen Theologie', in P. Ricoeur & E. Jüngel (eds.), *Metapher. Zur Hermeneutiek religiöser Sprache*, pp. 71–122, Chr. Kaiser Verlag, München.
- Jüngel, E., [1977] 1992, Gott als Geheimnis der Welt. Zur Begründung der Theologie des Gekreuztigten im Streit zwischen Theismus und Atheismus, Mohr Siebeck, Tübingen.
- Kaplan, D., 2003, Ricoeur's critical theory, State University of New York Press, Albany, New York.
- Kögler, H.H., 1996, The Power of dialogue: Critical hermeneutics after Gadamer and Foucault, transl. P. Hendrickson, MIT, Cambridge, MA.
- Kushkaki, M., 2013, Unmasking the villain: A reconstruction of the villain archetype in popular culture, San Diego State University, San Diego.
- Long, A.A., 2001, Epictetus: A Stoic and Socratic guide to life, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Maduro, O., 1982, Religion and social conflict, Orbis Books, Maryknoll.
- Metz, J.-B., 1967, 'Kirche und Welt im Lichte einer 'Politischen Theologie' in J.B Metz, Zum Begriff der neuen Politischen Theologie, 1967–1997, Matthias Grünewald, Ostfildern.
- Metz, J.-B., [1968] 1969, Zur Theologie der Welt, transl. W. Glen-Doepel, Matthias Grünewald, Ostfildern.
- Metz, J.-B., 1973, 'Kleine Apologie des Erzählens', Concilium 9, 334–342.
- Moltmann, J., 2000, Experiences in theology. Ways and forums of Christian theology, transl. M. Kohl, SCM Press, London.
- Moltmann, J., [2006] 2008, A broad place, an autobiography, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Mootz, F.J. (III) & Taylor, G.H., 2011, Gadamer and Ricoeur: Critical horizons for contemporary hermeneutics, Continuum, New York.
- Mortimore-Smith, S.R., 2012, 'Fuelling the spectacle: the audience as Gamemaker', in M.F. Pharr & L.A. Clark (eds.), *Of bread, blood and the Hunger Games: Critical essays on the Suzanne Collins Trilogy*, pp. 159–166, McFarland & Company Inc. Publishers, North Carolina.
- Neville, G., 2004, Free time. Towards a theology of leisure, The University of Birmingham Press, Birmingham.

- Noda, K., 2013, 'Paradoxes of life: Challenges, responses, and the meaning of life', *Journal of Unification Studies* (14), 109–127.
- Pavlink, A., 2012, 'Absolute power games', in M.F. Pharr & L.A. Clark (eds.), Of bread, blood and the Hunger Games: Critical essays on the Suzanne Collins trilogy, pp. 30–38, McFarland & Company Inc. Publishers, North Carolina.
- Pharr, M.F. & Clark, L.A. (eds.), 2012, Of bread, blood and the Hunger Games: Critical essays on the Suzann Collins Trilogy, McFarland & Company Inc. Publishers, North Carolina.
- Ricoeur, P., 1970, Freud and philosophy: An essay on interpretation, transl. D. Savage, Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Ricoeur, P., 1984, *Time and narrative*, vol. 1, transl. K. McLaughlin & D. Pellauer, Chicago University Press, London. http://dx.doi.org/10.7208/chicago/9780226713519.001.0001
- Ritschl, D., 1976, "Story" als Rohmaterial der Theologie', in J.O. Jones (ed.), 'Story' als Rohmaterial der Theologie, pp. 7–41, Kaiser, München.
- Ritschl, D., 1984, Logik der Theologie. Kurze Darstellung der Zusammenhänge theologischer Grundgedanken, Kaiser, München.
- Schüssler Fiorenza, F., 1986, 'Feminist theology as a critical theology of liberation', *Theological Studies* 34(4), 605–622.
- Schüssler Fiorenza, E., 2007, *The power of the word: Scripture and the rhetoric of Empire*, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Schüssler Fiorenza, E., 2013, 'Critical feminist the\*logy of liberation: A decolonizing Political The\*logy', in F. Schüssler Fiorenza, K. Tanner & M. Welker (eds.), *Political theology: Contemporary challenges and future directions*, pp. 23–36, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Schüssler Fiorenza, F., Tanner, K. & Welker, M. (eds.), 2013, Political theology: Contemporary challenges and future directions, pp. xiii-xiv, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Schutte, P.J.W., 2005, 'When they, we, and the passive become I: Introducing autobiographical biblical criticism', HTS Theological Studies/Teologiese Studies 61(1 & 2), 401–416.
- South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC), 2016, 'SA "born free" students see the world through the prism of race', 14 March 2016, viewed 05 June 2016, from http://www.sabc.co.za/news/a/1d326a004c06577c82cb8bf0bca466af
- Thiselton, A.C., [2001] 2006, "Postmodern" challenges to hermeneutics: "Behind" and "in front of" the text Language, reference and indeterminacy, in A.C. Thiselton, *Thiselton on hermeneutics: Collected works with new essays*, pp. 607–624, Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Tracy, D., 1975, Blessed rage for order: The new pluralism in theology, The Seabury Press, New York.
- Tracy, D., 1987, Plurali ty and ambiguity. Hermeneutics, religion, hope, University of Chicago Press, Chicago.
- University of Pretoria, Faculty of Theology, 2014, 'Faculty Plan', University of Pretoria, Pretoria.
- University of Pretoria, Faculty of Theology, 2016, 'Research and Research focus', viewed 30 May 2016, from http://www.up.ac.za/en/faculty-of-theology/article/33341/research-focus-areas
- Van Aarde, A.G., 2012, 'Verset teen mag: Die pelgrim se reis in drie "Sondergut" gelykenisse in Lukas 15 en 16', HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies 68(1), Art. #1032, 11 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v68i1.1032

- Van Aarde, A., 2015, 'Ecodomy: Life in its fullness if love rules the oikoumene, Verbum et Ecclesia 36(3), Art. #1396, 8 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve.v36i3.1396
- Van Aarde, A.G. & Dreyer, Y., 2010, 'Matthew studies today a willingness to suspect and a willingness to listen', HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies 66(1), Art. #820, 10 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v66i1.82
- Van Wyk, T., 2014, 'Nation, "ethnic people" (das Volk), religion and the church as ellipse of reconciling diversity', originally published in Afrikaans as, 'Nasie, volk, religie en die kerk as ellips van versoenende verskeidenheid', HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies 70(3), Art. #2671, 10 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v70i3.2671
- Van Wyk, T., 2015, 'Political Theology as critical theology', HTS Teologiese Studies/ Theological Studies 71(3), Art. #3026, 8 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts. v71i3.3026
- Vilhauer, M., 2010, *Gadamer's ethics of play: Hermeneutics and the Other*, Lexington Books, Maryland. Weinrich, H., 1973, 'Narrative Theologie', *Concilium* 9, 329–334.
- Wezner, K., 2012, "Perhaps I am watching you now": Panem's Pantopticons', in M.F. Pharr & L.A. Clark (eds.), Of bread, blood and the Hunger Games: Critical essays on the Suzann Collins Trilogy, pp. 148–158, McFarland & Company Inc. Publishers, North Carolina.
- World Council of Churches (WCC), 1983, '6th Annual Assembly in Vancouver' in *Oikoumene*, viewed 06 June 2016, from https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/assembly/1983-vancouver

- Ambrose, 1896, *De officiis ministrorum*, transl. H. de Romestin, E. de Romestin & H.T.F. Duckworth, P. Schaff & H. Wace (eds.), Christian Literature Publishing Co., Buffalo. (Nicene and post-Nicene Fathers, ser. 2, vol.10)
- Archilochus, 1999, Greek lambic poetry: Archilochus, Simonides, Hipponax, transl. & ed. D.E. Gerber, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Aristophanes, 2008, *Fragments*, transl. & J. Henderson (ed.), Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Aristotle, 1989, *Topica*, transl. E.S. Forster, Cambridge, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Augustine, [1886–1889] 1994, *The letters of St. Augustin*, P. Schaff (ed.), Hendrickson, Peabody. (The Nicene and post-Nicene Fathers, ser. 1, vol.1)
- Basil, 1926, *Letters*, vol. I, *Letters 1–58*, transl. R.J. Deferrari, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Bauer, W.F., Danker, F.W., Arndt, W.F. & Gingrich, W.F., 1999, Greek-English lexicon of the New Testament and other early Christian literature, University of Chicago Press, Chicago.
- Buttrick, D., 2000, *Speaking in parables: A homiletical guide*, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville. Cassian, J., 1997, *Conferences*, transl. B. Ramsey, D.E. Pichery (ed.), Paulist Press, New York.

- Chrysostom, J., 1840, Commentary on the epistles to the Galatians, and homilies on the epistle to the Ephesians, transl. W.J. Copeland, John Henry Parker, Oxford.
- Demosthenes, 1939, In Theocrinem, transl. A.T. Murray, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Derrett, J.D.M., 1978, 'The friend at midnight: Asian ideas in the gospel of St. Luke', in E. Bammel, C.K. Barret & W.D. Davies (eds.), *Donum Gentilicium: New Testament Studies in Honor of David Daube*, pp. 78–87, Clarendon Press, Oxford.
- Dio Cassius, 1914–1927, Roman history, vol. 1–9, transl. E. Cary, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Donahue, J.R., 1988, The gospel in parable: Metaphor, narrative, and theology in the Synoptic gospels, Fortress Press, Philadelphia.
- Funk, R.W., Hoover, R.W. & The Jesus Seminar, 1993, The five gospels: What did Jesus really say? The search for the authentic words of Jesus: New translation and commentary, Macmillan Publishing Company, New York.
- Herodian, 1970, *History of the Empire*, vol. I, Books 1–4, transl. C.R. Whittaker, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Herodotus, 1922, *The Persian wars*, vol. III, Books 5–7, transl. A.D. Godley, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Herzog, W.R., 1994, Parables as subversive speech: Jesus as pedagogue of the oppressed, Westminster John Knox Press, Louisville.
- Homer, 1984, *The Odyssey*, vol. 2, transl. A.T. Murray, Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Hoover, R.W., 2001, 'Incredible creed, credible faith: Problem and promise', in K. Armstrong, D. Cupitt, R.W. Funk, L. Geering, J.S. Spong & Fellows of the Jesus Seminar (eds.), *The once & future faith*, pp. 81–100, Polebridge Press, Santa Rosa.
- Hultgren, A.J., 2000, *The parables of Jesus: A commentary*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Grand Rapids. (The Bible in its world)
- Josephus, 1976, Josephus in nine volumes, transl. H.St.J. Thackeray, Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Kistemaker, S.J., 1980, The parables: Understanding the stories Jesus told, Baker Books, Grand Rapids.
- Kok, J., 2015, 'The radicality of early Christian oikodome: A theology that edifies insiders and outsiders', *Verbum et Ecclesiae* 36(3), Art. #1441, 12 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/ve. v36i3.1441
- Liddel, H.G. & Scott, R., 1968, A Greek-English lexicon, Clarendon Press, Oxford.
- Lockyer, H., 1963, All the parables of the Bible, Zondervan, Grand Rapids.
- Malina, B.J. & Rohrbaugh, R.L., 2003, Social-science commentary on the Synoptic gospels, 2nd edn., Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Menander, 1979, Menander, vol. I–III, transl. W.G. Arnott (ed.), Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)

- Oakman, D.E., 2008, Jesus and the peasants, Cascade Books, Eugene. (Matrix: The Bible in Mediterranean Context)
- Origen, 1951, Commentary on Matthew, transl. J. Patrick, A. Menzies (ed.), Grand Rapids, Eerdmans. (The ante-Nicene Fathers, ser. 1, vol. 10)
- Plato, 1911, *Phaedrus*, transl. J. Henderson (ed.), Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Plato, 1926, Leges, transl. E.G. Bury, Cambridge, Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Plutarch, 1936, *Moralia*, vol. 5, transl. C. Babbitt, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library).
- Schaff, P., 1890, Nicene and post-Nicene Fathers, ser. 1, vol. 2, The Christian Literature Publishing Co., New York. (Christian Classic Ethereal Library)
- Scott, B.B., 1989, Hear then the parable: A commentary on the parables of Jesus, Fortress Press, Minneapolis.
- Shepherd of Hermas, 2003, *Apostolic fathers*, vol. II, transl. B. Ehrman, Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Sibylline Oracles, viewed 28 August 2016, from http://www.sacredtexts.com/cla/sib/sib06.htm
- Snodgrass, K.R., 1997, 'Anaideia and the friend at midnight (Lk 11:8)', *Journal of Biblical Literature* 116(3), 505–513.
- Snodgrass, K.R., 2008, Stories with intent: A comprehensive guide to the parables of Jesus, William B. Eerdmans, Grand Rapids.
- Sophocles, 1994, *Ajax, Electra, Oedipus Tyrannus*, transl. H. Lloyd-Jones, Cambridge, Harvard University Press. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Tatian, 1994, *Diatessaron*, A. Roberts & J. Donaldson (eds.), Hendrickson, Peabody. (The ante-Nicene Fathers, ser. 1, vol. 9)
- Tertullian, 1972, Adversus Marcionem, transl. E. Evans, Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)
- Van Eck, E., 2011, 'When neighbours are not neighbours: A social-scientific reading of the parable of the friend at midnight (Lk 11:5–8)', *Hervormde Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies* 67(1), Art. #788, 14 pages. http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/hts.v67i1.788
- Xenophon, 2013, Memorabilia, Oeconomicus, Symposium, Apology, transl. E.C. Marchant & O.J. Todd, Harvard University Press, Cambridge. (Loeb Classical Library)